

This report needs to be read in conjunction with the Decision Notice.

DATE INSPECTED: 8 JULY 2015

TELEPHONE CALLS: YES / NO
DATE:

Ribble Valley Borough Council

DELEGATED ITEM FILE REPORT - REFUSAL

Ref: CB/CMS

Application No:	3/2015/0318/P
Development Proposed:	Roof extension above detached garages to form live in carer space at The Holly, Wardsley Road, Chipping, PR3 2QT

CONSULTATIONS: Parish/Town Council

Parish Council - No comments or observations received within the 21 day consultation period or by the date of writing this report (14 August 2015).

CONSULTATIONS: Highway/Water Authority/Other Bodies

N/A.

CONSULTATIONS: Additional Representations

RVBC Countryside Officers – No objections.

No representations from the nearest neighbours have been received.

RELEVANT POLICIES:

Ribble Valley Core Strategy (Adopted Version)

Key Statement EN2 – Landscape.

Key Statement EN4 – Biodiversity and Geodiversity.

Key Statement EN5 – Heritage Assets.

Policy DMG1 – General Considerations.

Policy DMH4 – Conversion of Barns and other Buildings to Dwellings.

Policy DME3 – Site and Species Protection and Conservation.

Policy DME4 – Protecting Heritage Assets.

POLICY REASONS FOR REFUSAL:

Key Statement EN2 and Policy DMG1 - the proposal would not be sympathetic to the parent dwelling and would harm the visual amenities of the AONB.

COMMENTS/ENVIRONMENTAL/AONB/HUMAN RIGHTS ISSUES/RECOMMENDATION:

This application seeks permission to increase the height of an existing treble garage to form accommodation at first floor level for a live in carer to serve the residents of The Holly, a barn conversion approved in 1998/99.

The proposal seeks to raise the garage roof to provide first floor living space above the current vehicle store. The proposal would see an additional floor created which would result in a 1.0m increase in building height, the insertion of 3 flat roof box dormers and a roof light to the north elevation which faces in towards the site and for 4 roof lights on the rear elevation which fronts the highway of Wardsley Road. The annex would be accessed via the front elevation (which faces away from Wardsley Road) via an internal stairway which would provide access to a bathroom, double bedroom and kitchen lounge area, all at first floor.

The height of the eaves of the existing garage would increase from 2.55m to 3.69m, an increase of 1.14m. The ridge height of the garage would increase from 4.71m to 5.86m, an increase of approximately 1.16m. 3 box dormers are proposed above each of the existing garage doors. These would have approximate dimensions of 2.3m x 1.9m x 1.4m. Two first floor windows are proposed in either gable end (east and west).

Assessment

The garage building is located adjacent to a former barn conversion which is located on the northern side of Wardsley Road in a rural countryside area within the Forest of Bowland Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty. The property is located on the outskirts of Chipping Village, approximately 1.1 miles away from the village.

The converted barn is located to the south of a Grade II listed building known as Wardsley Farm and is located to the north of another listed building known as Stakes Farm. Stakes Farm is located on the opposite side of the river from the application site.

In respect of the principle of development, Policy DMH5 of the Core Strategy recognises the need to provide accommodation for elderly or dependent relatives proving the proposal is for a modest level of accommodation and can be easily integrated into the main dwelling once circumstances have changed. The motivation behind the proposal have been presented and verified by medical evidence and the self-contained annex would provide accommodation for a live in carer thus benefitting the elderly residents of the adjacent barn conversion.

Policy DMH5 however cannot be considered in isolation and the other policies in the plan need to be fully considered. The main policy to consider is Key Statement EN2: Landscape.

The existing building is located in the nationally designated Forest of Bowland Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty. Within the AONB landscape character area assessment the area is classified as the Upper Hodder, Wooded Rural Valleys. This landscape is characterised by undulating lanes dipping into and out of the valleys and scattered farmsteads. The application site is located off a narrow road which is bordered by traditional hedgerows and is characterised by scattered, isolated, farmsteads, with The Holly, historically being a roadside field barn.

The existing garage lies adjacent to the highway and is built in modern reclaimed stone. As it stands this garage is not as sympathetic to the barn conversion in which it belongs to as it could be due to the materials of the garage not matching the main barn, and the concrete tile roof of the garage. Notwithstanding this, the garage currently appears as a subordinate addition to the substantial barn conversion.

The Agent states that the proposals will only increase the height of the garage by 1.0m, however, the LPA considers this statement is misleading. The proposals would see the increase in eaves height of the garage by 1.1m and the increase in overall height also by approximately 1.2m. This increase in height would result in the increased bulk and massing of this garage, and the presence of flat roof lead topped flat roof dormers would significantly change the relationship between the traditional barn and its subordinate outbuilding to the detriment of the setting of the barn conversion (historically a roadside barn) and importantly the visual amenities of this part of the AONB.

The gables of the garage are clearly visible from Wardsley Road in both directions and the increase in the bulk and massing of the garage building and the insertion of windows in the gables, combined with the dormer window projections, would increase the visual prominence in the building. This combined with the proposed dormer windows would undoubtedly detract from the rural AONB landscape in which the building is situated.

When viewing the northern elevation of the garage in context with the dominant rear catslide roof of the barn conversion; the proposed increase in height of the garage and the proposed box dormer windows would begin to compete with, and detract from the standalone setting of the traditional barn. The flat roof box dormers would not be in keeping with the parent barn conversion to which the garage relates and, when viewing the rear of the site in long range views when travelling towards the site along Dinkling Green Lane would conflict with this

traditional barn and its catslide roof which is a very dominant feature in longer range views of the site from various points on Dinkling Green Lane. The proposal would appear as an incongruous feature in this part of the AONB which would be to the detriment of the visual amenities of the Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty.

To conclude, whilst the personal needs of the applicants are recognised and the LPA sympathises with their circumstances, the personal needs of an applicant does not outweigh landscape harm. The harm to the visual amenities of this nationally designated landscape is considered to be unacceptable and on this basis it is recommended that the application be resisted.

RECOMMENDATION: That permission be refused.

ADDRESSING THE REASON FOR REFUSAL:

It may be that the applicant forgoing one vehicular garage could erect a small extension to the existing garage which could provide a small annexe for a live in carer. This would negate the need to increase the height and massing of the garage in the manner proposed. The LPA advise the applicants to seek pre-application advice from the LPA. However, given there are potentially other options to consider the LPA considers it inappropriate to allow the proposals on the basis of the special circumstances that exist.