

Report to be read in conjunction with the Decision Notice.

Application Ref:	3/2016/0847	 Ribble Valley Borough Council www.ribblevalley.gov.uk
Date Inspected:	12/10/2016	
Officer:	RH	
DELEGATED ITEM FILE REPORT:		

REFUSAL

Development Description:	Replacement of six timber windows with cream PCVu.
Site Address/Location:	3 The Stables, Withgill Fold, BB7 3LW.

CONSULTATIONS:	Parish/Town Council
No representations have been received in respect of the proposed development.	

RELEVANT POLICIES AND SITE PLANNING HISTORY:

Ribble Valley Core Strategy:

Policy EN2 - Landscape
Policy DMG1 – General Considerations
Policy DME2 – Landscape and Townscape Protection
Policy DMH5 – Residential and Curtilage Extensions

National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF)

Relevant Planning History:

3/1993/0278: Conversion of barn to form 3 No. dwellings and erection of detached garage block (Approved with conditions).

ASSESSMENT OF PROPOSED DEVELOPMENT:

Site Description and Surrounding Area:

The application dwelling is a two storey mid-terraced barn conversion located within a group of properties known as Withgill Fold. The site is located within the open countryside, 1.5 miles west of the settlement of Clitheroe. The property is accessed via a shared access track off Whalley Road. The application property became a residential dwelling following a permission granted in June 1993 for the conversion of the barn into 3 dwellings (3/1993/0278). This planning permission removed permitted development rights and hence the replacement timber windows with cream PVCu requiring planning approval in this particular case.

Proposed Development for which consent is sought:

Consent is sought for the replacement of six timber windows with cream PCVu at 3 The Stable, Withgill Fold. Three existing timber windows on the front elevation and three existing timber windows on the rear elevation will be removed and replaced with cream PCVu windows. The windows will utilise the existing window openings.

Impact Upon Residential Amenity:

The proposal seeks to replace the existing timber windows to PVCu; these would have no greater impact upon neighbouring residents than the existing windows. Therefore, it is considered that the proposed development would not adversely harm the residential amenity of the adjoining property.

Visual Amenity/External Appearance:

Traditional farm buildings should remain largely unaltered and remain looking like farm buildings after conversion in order to protect them as a feature within the landscape. The existing timber window openings represent sympathetic materials to the character and appearance of the traditional building.

Historic England produced the following document 'Traditional Windows: their care, repair and upgrading' (April 2015) states that *"Windows are the eyes of a building - they let in light and give views out - and profoundly affect its appearance ... An assessment of the significance of a window or windows and the contribution they make to the overall significance of a building is an important first step in deciding the right course of action"* (page 3).

"Aesthetic Value - Fenestration may form an integral part of the design of the building or contribute to a building's visual character. If later in date, its aesthetic qualities may add to the interest of a building. Replicas or recreations of fenestration of aesthetic quality will maintain this value. In contrast, much off-the-peg joinery is of little aesthetic value and is unsympathetic to the visual qualities of historic buildings" (page 4).

"The appearance and character of PVC-u windows is highly likely to make them unsuitable for older buildings, particularly those that are listed or in conservation areas. PVC-u is short for Poly Vinyl Chloride un-plasticised and these windows are assembled from factory-made components designed for rigidity, thermal performance and ease of production. Their design, detailing and operation make them look completely different to traditional windows. Manufacturers have been unable to replicate the sections/glazing bars used in timber and steel windows due to the limited strength of the material ... Repairs can be a major problem. Because of the nature of PVC-u, complete replacement is often the only viable option, which makes them a very unsustainable solution when compared to timber ... The frames of PVC-u windows need cleaning every six months to prevent discolouration from dirt and ultra violet light. They also need to be lubricated and adjusted annually and weather-seals and gaskets renewed at least every ten years ..." (page 6-7).

Taking into consideration the above it is considered that the approval of this application, to allow PVCu windows would undermine the application building. When considering alterations to barn conversions the Local Planning Authority require all applications to be sympathetic to the character and appearance of the building. Allowing the insertion of PVCu windows into a barn conversion would set a precedent for other barn conversions to be undertaken with the use of non-traditional materials. PVCu windows are predominantly shiny, smooth and uniform in appearance. It is considered that the appearance of the PVCu windows would not be sympathetic to the traditional appearance of the existing building or surrounding area contrary to Key Statement EN2 and Policies DMG1 and DME2 of the Ribble Valley Core Strategy.

Observations/Consideration of Matters Raised/Conclusion:

The proposed replacement of all the existing timber windows with PVCu windows would be harmful to the character and appearance of the barn conversion and the surrounding area. The replacement windows would result in modern and incongruous features that would fail to preserve the barn conversion's traditional appearance and the proposal is therefore considered to be contrary to Key Statement EN2 and Policies DMG1 and DME2 of the Ribble Valley Core Strategy and the relevant section of the NPPF.

RECOMMENDATION:

That planning consent be refused for the following reason(s)

- | | |
|-----------|---|
| 01 | The proposed replacement of the existing timber windows with PVCu windows would be harmful to the character and appearance of the existing building and the surrounding area. The replacement windows would result in modern and incongruous features that would fail to preserve the barn conversion's traditional appearance and the proposal is therefore considered to be contrary to Key Statement EN2 and Policies DMG1 and DME2 of the Ribble Valley Core Strategy and the relevant section of the NPPE. |
| 02 | The proposed development would create a harmful precedent for the acceptance of other similar proposals to replace traditional timber windows with PVCu windows on barn conversions, which cumulatively would have an adverse impact on barn conversions within the Borough, contrary to Key Statement EN2 and Policies DMG1 and DME2 of the Ribble Valley Core Strategy. |