

Application 3/2020/0053: Demolition of timber garage. Extension of floor slab and erection of new garage at ground floor with workshop at first floor/roof level at Hougher Fall Old Clitheroe Road Dutton

Site inspection will be required to provide an assessment of the impact of the proposal on the setting of the listed building*. However, immediate desk analysis observations:

The C19 map regression (Heritage Statement) shows the listed barn to be isolated from the farmhouse and atypical for vernacular upland farmsteads (linear)

<https://historicengland.org.uk/images-books/publications/historic-farmsteads-preliminary-character-statement-north-west/>

The list description identifies *"The adjoining C20 buildings to the north and east are not of special interest and are not included in the listing"*.

NPPG 'Conserving and Enhancing the Historic Environment' paragraph 13 identifies *"the way in which we experience an asset in its setting is also influenced by ... our understanding of the historic relationship between places"*. The relative isolation of the listed barn from other buildings is an important element of its setting <https://www.gov.uk/guidance/conserving-and-enhancing-the-historic-environment>

The Heritage Statement incorrectly asserts that only interior cruck frames are of interest. As noted above, the list description identifies those structures/features without interest. The listing Summary states *"Three bay cruck-framed stone clad barn of late medieval to late C17 date, with C18/C19 cladding"*. The listing Reasons for Designation states *"Historic interest: the barn is a reminder of the farming practices of this part of Lancashire, and demonstrates in its fabric the history of the farm as part of the Dutton Estate"*. The listing History identifies the importance of stone cladding to understanding of the barn's phased development *"The existence of three cruck trusses in the barn suggests a late medieval to late C17 date, probably with a later stone cladding of the walls. Variations in the stone work indicate a number of phases, including the probable rebuilding of the south gable end and much of the west side wall and the loss of a probably cart entrance on the west side. The positioning of the crucks, one of which is only just over one metre from the north gable end, might be the result of a change in the length of the barn, and stonework in a later attached store to the north, containing large quoins, could be re-used from the barn itself"*

<https://historicengland.org.uk/listing/the-list/list-entry/1404130>

'Adapting Traditional Farm Buildings' (Historic England, 2017) discusses the importance of setting at page 18:

"Minimising the impact on the setting is an important aspect of a successful project. This often requires a light touch and an understanding of what features characterise the setting, including other buildings and spaces in the farmstead and their relationship to the landscape... The other key characteristic of farmsteads is the way the landscape often flows up to the immediate edge of the buildings without any form of definition...The relationship of the farmstead to its farmland should be respected ... the paraphernalia associated with domestic use need to be carefully sited and contained, particularly in relation to public views and the surrounding landscape".

Page 37 discusses new extensions and buildings:

“a carefully designed extension or new structure might be considered alongside a farm building if this will safeguard the significance of the main structure. An extension or new building that houses ancillary functions that require a high degree of partition can leave an undivided historic space free from subdivision, thus protecting its character” (not applicable to this proposal?) *“Extensions for other uses, such as garages, are less easily justified ... Whether contemporary in design or based on an existing structure, extensions and new buildings should be subordinate in scale and relate to the massing and character of the existing farmstead group. Maps, photographs and other historic images may record the scale, form and detail of significant lost buildings which can be considered for reconstruction”* <https://historicengland.org.uk/images-books/publications/adapting-traditional-farm-buildings/heag158-adapting-traditional-farm-buildings/>

The inclusion of limited static viewpoints in the Heritage Statement and proposals for a larger and more prominent garage/workshop do not appear to have considered issues of cumulative impact and the potential variety of important views discussed in the NPPG and ‘The Setting of Heritage Assets’ (Historic England, 2017):

“The contribution that setting makes to the significance of the heritage asset does not depend on there being public rights of way or an ability to otherwise access or experience that setting. The contribution may vary over time.

When assessing any application which may affect the setting of a heritage asset, local planning authorities may need to consider the implications of cumulative change. They may also need to consider the fact that developments which materially detract from the asset’s significance may also damage its economic viability now, or in the future, thereby threatening its ongoing conservation” (NPPG paragraph 13).

“Because the contribution of setting to significance does not depend on public rights or ability to access it, significance is not dependent on numbers of people visiting it; this would downplay such qualitative issues ... The potential for appreciation of the asset’s significance may increase once it is interpreted or mediated in some way, or if access to currently inaccessible land becomes possible ... the economic viability of a heritage asset can be reduced if the contribution made by its setting is diminished by badly designed or insensitively located development” (The Setting of Heritage Assets, paragraph 9).

“views, a purely visual impression of an asset or place which can be static or dynamic, long, short or of lateral spread, and include a variety of views of, from, across, or including that asset” (The Setting of Heritage Assets, paragraph 10).

‘Making Changes to Heritage Assets’ (Historic England, 2016) identifies:

“It would not normally be good practice for new work to dominate the original asset or its setting in either scale, material or as a result of its siting” (paragraph 41)
<https://historicengland.org.uk/images-books/publications/making-changes-heritage-assets-advice-note-2/heag023-making-changes-to-heritage-assets/>

In listing the planning history and suggesting *“the barn is no longer used for agricultural purposes”*, the Heritage Statement appears to misinterpret the intentional and measured compromise to special architectural and historic interest and setting in residential conversion which was to ensure the Optimum Viable Use of the listed barn. This appears to have led to development

design being led by a wish to create *“an attractive garage within an existing residential environment”* (Heritage Statement; Justification).

The impact on the cultural heritage of the AONB will be assessed on site inspection. NPPF paragraph 172 identifies of AONBs that *“the conservation and enhancement of wildlife and cultural heritage are also important considerations in these areas”*. The Forest of Bowland AONB Management Plan; April 2014 - March 2019 identifies *“The Forest of Bowland was formally designated an AONB in 1964 due to a variety of factors, including... The landscape’s historic and cultural associations ... The distinctive pattern of settlements”* and *“There is evident contrast in the villages in Bowland ... Collectively these historic and cultural elements of the environment serve to enrich the landscape’s scenic quality, meaning and value”*.

Adrian Dowd BSc (Hons) MA (URP) MA (Arch Cons) RTPI IHBC

Principal Planning Officer

* ‘A Staged Approach to Proportionate Decision -Taking’ in ‘The Setting of Heritage Assets’ (Historic England, 2017) <https://historicengland.org.uk/images-books/publications/gpa3-setting-of-heritage-assets/heag180-gpa3-setting-heritage-assets/>