|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Application Ref:** | | 3/2022/0648 | | | Graphical user interface, text, application  Description automatically generated | |
| **Date Inspected:** | | 07/09/2022 | | |
| **Officer:** | | MW | | |
| **DELEGATED ITEM FILE REPORT:** | | | | | **Decision** | **REFUSAL** |
|  | | | | | | |
| **Development Description:** | | | | Proposed replacement of existing UPVC conservatory with a painted wood orangery. | | |
| **Site Address/Location:** | | | | Nethergill Barn Main Street Bolton-By-Bowland BB7 4NW | | |
|  | | | | | | |
| **CONSULTATIONS:** | | | | **Parish/Town Council** | | |
| No comment received. | | | | | | |
|  | | | | | | |
| **CONSULTATIONS:** | | | | **Additional Representations.** | | |
| None. | | | | | | |
|  | | | | | | |
| **RELEVANT POLICIES AND SITE PLANNING HISTORY:** | | | | | | |
| **Ribble Valley Core Strategy:**  Key Statement DS1 – Development Strategy  Key Statement DS2 – Sustainable Development  Key Statement EN2: Landscape  Key Statement EN5 – Heritage Assets  Policy DMG1 – General Considerations  Policy DMG2 – Strategic Considerations  Policy DME4 – Protecting Heritage Assets  **Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act**  **National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF)** | | | | | | |
| **Relevant Planning History:**  3/2004/0358 – Proposed Kitchen Extension and Extension to Bedroom. **AC.**  3/87/0690 – Change of Use of Barn to Dwelling. **AC** | | | | | | |
|  | | | | | | |
| **ASSESSMENT OF PROPOSED DEVELOPMENT:** | | | | | | |
| **Site Description and Location:**  This application relates to a detached dwelling within the settlement boundary of Bolton-by-Bowland. The property lies on Main Street, set back from the roadside behind an existing row of cottages which the building has previously related to. The property is the result of a barn conversion granted permission in 1987, through which many features have been retained including natural stone walls, timber windows and doors with stone surrounds and a natural slate roof. These are now the property’s characterising features, with a small curtilage and uPVC conservatory at the rear of the property which has been added under permitted development. Beyond the property to the north the surrounding area is predominantly open grassland, with a farmstead beyond this approximately 85 metres away. The site location falls within Bolton-by-Bowland Conservation Area and is further identified as a building of townscape merit such is the building’s historic interest, and furthermore sits within the designated Forest of Bowland Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty. | | | | | | |
| **Proposed Development for which consent is sought:**  Consent is sought for the demolition of an existing uPVC conservatory at the rear of the property and its replacement with a painted orangery. The replacement orangery will measure 4.5 metres in depth and feature an eaves height of 2.5 metres, with overall height of 3.2 metres, representing a larger footprint than the existing structure. A low wall akin to that on the existing conservatory will be maintained within the new scheme, becoming a full height wall on the western elevation to allow for an increased level of privacy when viewed from the west. The materials in use within the proposed scheme will replace the uPVC of the existing conservatory with a timber framed structure, with screening in the form of soft landscaping also proposed on the wall of the western elevation. | | | | | | |
| **Residential Amenity:**  The proposed orangery is to be located at the rear of the property in a very similar position to the existing conservatory. Nethergill Barn is set back significantly from Main Street and surrounding residential properties, and as a result, its rear elevation is in excess of 8 metres from the closest neighbouring dwelling. By virtue of this separation distance and the similarity in dimensions between the existing conservatory and the replacement orangery, no undue overshadowing impacts are identified.  In respect of overlooking, the proposed development clearly acknowledges the privacy issues which currently exist in the form of overlooking opportunities westward from the conservatory and patio area of the application property. As such, a full height wall and additional screening on this elevation are proposed in mitigation which would reduce the impacts of the scheme in respect of residential amenity should the application be approved. | | | | | | |
| **Visual Amenity/External Appearance:**  Policy DMG1 of the Ribble Valley Core Strategy states that all development must:  *“2. Be sympathetic to existing and proposed land uses in terms of its size, intensity and nature as well as scale, massing, style, features and building materials.*  *3. Consider the density, layout and relationship between buildings, which is of major importance. Particular emphasis will be placed on visual appearance and the relationship to surroundings, including impact on landscape character, as well as the effects of development on existing amenities.”*  The proposed orangery will be sited on the rear elevation of Nethergill Barn which is set back considerably from the main road through the village. As a result, the impact of this development upon the character or visual amenities of that existing street scene is negligible. This notwithstanding, the rear elevation of the application property is afforded with great openness to the north, east and west, meaning the proposed development would be visible when viewed from these directions.  The proposed orangery will replace an existing uPVC conservatory and whilst sited in the same place, will project beyond the rear elevation of the property by 4.5 metres, in excess of a metre beyond the existing conservatory. Notwithstanding the existing conservatory, the proposed orangery will read as a disproportionate addition relative to the footprint of the host property. Barn conversions are commonly modest in footprint such is their original construction for non-residential uses and from this they obtain an element of character. Relative to this, the proposed development will increase the footprint and built form of the host property in an unsympathetic manner to the extent that its character is unduly compromised, in conflict with policy DMG1 of the Ribble Valley Core Strategy.  Whilst it is accepted this scheme may present a lower impact in comparison with the existing conservatory in respect of its roof pitch and amount of glazing, the remaining visual impact still exceeds that which would otherwise be deemed acceptable. The visual prominence of the orangery structure on this elevation will appear far greater such is the extent of glazing proposed, which though arguably reduced, remains at such a level to the extent that the orangery will detract from the modest character of the host property which arises through the unamended and unmodified nature of its original conversion. Whilst the introduction of timber to match the existing fenestration is welcomed, its positive contribution is limited such is the full height wall on the western elevation and continued dominance of glazing throughout.  On this basis, the development is considered to be in conflict with policies DMG1 of the Ribble Valley Core Strategy insofar as that the scheme fails to adequately consider its impact upon the host property and surrounding landscape character, and as such, is discordant and inharmonious relative to its surroundings. | | | | | | |
| **Impact upon Character/appearance of Conservations Area:**  The LPA must also accord with its duty at section 72 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990. This states:  ‘with respect to any buildings or other land in a conservation area, of any functions under or *by virtue of any of the provisions mentioned in subsection (2), special attention shall be paid to the desirability of preserving or enhancing the character or appearance of that area.’*  The site location within the designated Bolton-by-Bowland Conservation Area, characterised by historic cottages and barns built in the rural vernacular tradition of the 18th and 19th century. The conservation area features more than 20 listed buildings and, in its entirety, contains a high concentration of buildings which offer special and intrinsic historic interest. Whilst not listed, the application property has been judged as offering a positive contribution to the character and appearance of the conservation area and as such is designated a building of townscape merit. Moreover, the open curtilage of the property at the rear adjoins grassland which is identified as an 'important view’ from the conservation area as indicated on the Bolton-by-Bowland Townscape Appraisal Map.  Nethergill Barn currently features an existing conservatory at the rear of the property which it is assumed has been constructed under permitted development, rights which were not removed by condition at the time of the barn’s conversion and therefore remain intact. Whilst the lawfulness of this conservatory is therefore accepted, the structure has a damaging impact upon the character and visual amenity of the application property and as such it is not considered the conservatory would have been acceptable should have full planning permission been sought.  Relative to this, the proposed orangery would continue to possess features which would exacerbate and further consolidate the unacceptable harm inflicted upon the host dwelling and wider conservation area. The character of the existing property, derived through its modest footprint, largely un-altered form and extent to which original detailing has been retained, would continue to be degraded through the siting of a rear extension with a level of glazing which juxtaposes with the conservative scale of the existing fenestration, also found to be largely anomalous relative to the surrounding area.  Furthermore, the rear elevation of Nethergill Barn frames an important view out of the conservation area from east to west to the north of the property towards Beacon Hill. The proposed orangery, due to its scale, siting and glazing, would be clearly visible and as a result, unduly impact upon the nature of this view into, and out of, the conservation area.  Overall, the proposed development fails to conserve the inherent character of the host barn as a building of townscape merit which makes a positive and important contribution to the special architectural and historic character of Bolton-by-Bowland conservation area. The resultant harm to this area as a designated heritage asset conflicts with policy DME4 of the RVCS and paras. 201, 202 of the National Planning Policy Framework insofar as that the development would inflict unreasonable harm without justification or significant public benefit. | | | | | | |
| **Observations/Consideration of Matters Raised/Conclusion:**  It is for the above reasons and having regard to all material considerations and matters raised that the application is recommended for refusal. | | | | | | |
| **RECOMMENDATION**: | | | That planning permission be refused for the following reason(s): | | | |
| **01** | The proposal, by virtue of its glazing, scale and proportioning, would result in the introduction of an unsympathetic, incongruous and discordant form of development which fails to positively reflect or respond to the inherent character of the host property, being of significant detriment to the character and visual amenities of the area. As such the proposal is considered to be in direct conflict with Policy DMG1 of the Ribble Valley Core Strategy. | | | | | |
| **02** | The proposal, by virtue of its design, scale and visual prominence, would result in unjustifiable harm to a designated heritage asset insofar as that the development would degrade the architectural qualities, character and historic interest of a building identified as offering special contribution toward a conservation area, in direct conflict with Policy DME4 and EN5 of the Ribble Valley Core Strategy and paragraphs 201 and 202 of the National Planning Policy Framework. | | | | | |