

Wilkinson's Farmhouse, Simonstone Lane,
Simonstone, Burnley BB12 7NX.

Application for the erection of a double garage
structure with a first-floor home office.

LPA reference 3/2019/0689

Householder Planning Appeal Statement

November 2019

Judith Douglas BSc (Hons), Dip TP, MRTPI

**APPEAL UNDER SECTION 78 OF THE TOWN AND COUNTRY PLANNING ACT 1990
BY
MR AND MRS FORD
AGAINST THE REFUSAL OF RIBBLE VALLEY BOROUGH COUNCIL
TO GRANT HOUSEHOLDER PLANNING PERMISSION FOR THE ERECTION OF A
DOUBLE GARAGE STRUCTURE WITH A FIRST FLOOR HOME OFFICE
AT
WILKINSON'S FARMHOUSE SIMONSTONE LANE, SIMONSTONE. BURNLEY BB12
7NX**

GROUND'S OF APPEAL STATEMENT

1.0 INTRODUCTION

1.1 The planning application which is the subject of this appeal was received by Ribble Valley Borough Council on the 19th July 2019 and given the reference number 3/2019/0698. The householder application sought full planning permission to construct a detached double garage with a home office above.

1.2 The Council's Planning Officers refused planning permission in the 13th September 2019 for the following reasons:

"1. The proposal is harmful to the setting of Wilkinsons Farm because of its incongruous and unduly dominant siting forward of the main façade of the historic farmhouse. In addition the proposal would represent a detached form of development which would not respect the historic linear farmstead. This is contrary to Key Statement EN5 and Policies DME4 and DMG1 of the Ribble Valley Core Strategy.

2. The proposed development would result in loss to the visual amenity value provided by the site boundary tree group and harm to the character and appearance of the streetscene. The submitted scheme does not include proposals for the mitigation of this townscape impact. This is contrary to Key Statement EN2 and Policies DME1 and DME2 of the Ribble Valley Core Strategy."

1.3 This statement describes the site and its surroundings and the relevant planning guidance. The planning issues will be discussed before arriving at the conclusion that the proposed development accords with the development plan and national planning policy. Consequently, it is concluded that the appeal should be allowed.

2.0 APPEAL SITE AND SURROUNDINGS

2.1 Wilkinson's Farmhouse is a substantial two storey dwelling set within a large garden. The principle elevation faces east towards Simonstone Lane. The house and garden

are elevated above the road behind a stone retaining wall. The southern boundary of the garden is separated from the adjoining field by a stone retaining wall. There are a number of trees and shrubs within and mainly around the periphery of the garden. The building was listed GV 2 on the 12 February 1985.

- 2.2 Within the garden of the house at the rear adjacent to the northern boundary is a second listed building described in the list description as *"pigsties with poultry loft, circa 15 metres north west of Wilkinsons Farmhouse"*. The full list descriptions are contained in the Heritage Assessment submitted with the planning application.
- 2.3 On the opposite side of Simonstone Lane is another grade 2 listed building Starkie Farmhouse.¹

3.0 PLANNING POLICY

- 3.1 The Development Plan for the purposes of this appeal comprises the Ribble Valley Core Strategy (CS) which was adopted in 2014. Key Statement EN5 (Heritage Assets) and Policies DME4 (Protecting Heritage Assets) and DMG1 (General Considerations) seek to ensure that developments conserve and enhance the significance of heritage assets and encourage high standards of design. Key Statement EN2 (Landscape) and Policies DME1 (Protecting trees and woodlands) and DME2 (Landscape and townscape protection) seek to ensure that development reflects local distinctiveness, vernacular style and that the development is in keeping with the character of the landscape. They seek to protect important areas of woodland, trees and hedgerows.

National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF)

- 3.2 The NPPF is a statement of Government policy in relation to planning matters nationally. The Council's Development Plans must accord with the general principles detailed in the NPPF and it is a material consideration in the determination of all planning applications.
- 3.3 The NPPF does not change the statutory status of the development plan as the starting point for decision making. It states that development in accordance with an up to date

¹ Appendix 1 Starkie Farmhouse list description

Local Plan should be approved, and proposed development that conflicts should be refused unless material considerations indicate otherwise.

- 3.4 Section 16 Conserving and enhancing the historic environment is relevant to this appeal in particular paragraphs 192 which sets out what planning authorities should take account of in determining applications and 193 which requires great weight to be given to the conservation of designated heritage assets.

4.0 SITE HISTORY

- 4.1 The history of planning applications at the site is recorded in the Planning Officer's Delegated Item File Report. This reveals that the property was converted from a farmhouse and barn into a dwelling in the late 1960's. At the time of listing in 1985 the property was already wholly in use as a dwelling all agricultural use having ceased.

5.0 PLANNING APPRAISAL

- 5.1 According to the Council's decision notice, the appeal proposal would result in harm to the setting of the Listed Building. The proposals would represent a detached form of development which would not respect the historic linear farmstead. It would result in a loss of visual amenity as a result of trees loss and provides no mitigation measures to address this. The remainder of the Statement will deal with these matters accordingly.
- 5.2 The site comprises the former farmhouse and barn, the pig sties and the surrounding garden. The change in use from residential and agricultural use to wholly residential use of the buildings is reflected in the physical changes and alterations which have occurred over the last century. The designation as a listed building does not preclude alteration or change to the structure or its setting but does require any new development to sustain and enhance the fundamental significance of the asset in question NPPF 193.
- 5.3 The heritage significance of the listed building is described in the Heritage Assessment at paragraph 6.2 as deriving from its special architectural and historic interest which is that of *"a stone farmhouse built in a linear plan probably early 18th. However this special*

interest has been diluted owing to extensive modernisation which occurred in the mid-late 20th century and subsequently. This significance therefore now essentially resides in the appearance of the building's front elevation, as the rear is masked by an extension and the interior has been altered throughout with few features remaining. Beyond its intrinsic qualities, the farmhouse also shares group value with the pig sties owing to their historic proximity".

- 5.4 The Heritage Assessment asserts that setting of the listed building now has a residential character rather than that of a farmyard in which the buildings were originally sited. The proposed garage is not out of keeping with this residential character. This well-designed building modelled on a building of vernacular tradition is entirely appropriate in this context and causes no harm to the setting of the listed building. Nor does it impact upon the special attributes of the listed building of which its significance is derived.
- 5.5 The former farmhouse and attached barn have a linear form. The proposed garage does not detract from this form as it is not attached to the listed building. Rather it will appear as a physically and functionally subordinate ancillary structure. The linear plan of Wilkinson's Farm will remain readily apparent.
- 5.6 The proposed garage is sited on a part of the garden which is at a significantly lower level than the house. This ensures that the proposed garage does not dominate the house but would appear as subservient in relation to it. The building is positioned off-set from the front elevation of the house and will not interfere with any current public views of the front elevation of the listed building. The positioning of the garage building would not interrupt the visual connection between Wilkinson's Farm and the pig sties or Wilkinson's Farm and Starkie's Farm.
- 5.7 Views of the garage from the public realm would be limited to short range views from Simonstone Lane which would be softened by the existing trees and shrubs on the site which are to be retained. The Heritage Assessment has found strong evidence that historically a substantial ancillary structure existed in the approximate position of the proposed garage up until the late 19th century. It can be argued that the provision of garage preserves the memory of this building and this would respect the historic pattern of development at this former farmstead.

- 5.8 The provision of the double garage will allow vehicles to be parked out of sight rather than in front of the main elevation of the house which is the current arrangement. This will improve the public views of the listed building from Simonstone Lane. See photograph 1.²
- 5.9 The garden area of Wilkinson's Farmhouse is set behind a high retaining wall with the footway of Simonstone Lane below. The garden is roughly level with the top of the wall. Along the entire length of the garden boundary to Simonstone Lane there are dense ornamental trees and shrubs which create an attractive safety barrier to the drop. See photographs 2 and 3. The majority of the planting appears to be evergreen. The boundary to the field has similarly been planted with trees and shrubs and where there is a small gap, a young holly and conifer have been planted. See photograph 4.
- 5.10 The proposed garage is set away from the roadside behind the boundary walls and the boundary trees and shrubs. It is positioned within an area of the garden which is currently majority garden lawn. See photograph 5. It will be screened by the peripheral trees and shrubs within the garden area of Wilkinson's Farm the majority of which are to be retained. There is adequate space around the south and eastern sides of the building to retain existing planting and to supplement this if it is considered desirable.
- 5.11 Whilst the proposed garage is forward of the front elevation of Wilkinson's Farmhouse this will not appear dominant because it is set down at a lower level than the existing dwelling. This is clearly demonstrated on the proposed section drawings 5757-04C. Nor will the building appear incongruous as the former agricultural buildings on eastern side of this part of Simonstone Lane are positioned close to the road including Starkie's Farm House which is gable to the road see photograph 6, and the remaining walls of the former barn to Starkie's Farm which enclose the parking court to Old Barn House opposite the appeal site. See photograph 7
- 5.12 The Council's Countryside Officer is recorded as stating in the Officer's Report that the none of trees have a significant amenity value. The types of trees on the site are mostly ornamental rather than native species. A small number of trees will be removed to accommodate the development. It is not considered that this will have any significant impact on the overall amenity value of the wider tree-scape or street scene. A condition

² Appendix 2 Photographs and key

requiring replacement tree planting could be imposed if the Inspector considers that this is necessary and appropriate.

6.0 SUMMARY AND CONCLUSION

- 6.1 This Appeal Statement has justified the acceptability of planning application reference 3/2019/0698 which sought permission for the erection of a double garage structure with first floor home office.
- 6.2 It has been clearly demonstrated that the proposal will not harm the setting of the listed building Wilkinson's Farm. The proposed building is not out of keeping with the residential character of the listed building and being modelled on a building of vernacular tradition is entirely appropriate in its scale and appearance. The proposal fully accords with the requirements of Key Statement EN5 and Policies DME4 and DMG1 of the Ribble Valley Core Strategy.
- 6.3 It has also demonstrated that there will be no significant loss to visual amenity as the tree loss as a result of the development is not significant. If it is considered appropriate mitigation for tree loss can be provided through the imposition of a condition. The proposal fully accords with Key Statement EN2 and Policies DME1 and DME2 of the Ribble Valley Core Strategy
- 6.4 The proposal fully accords with the requirement of the National Planning Policy Framework in particular paragraphs 192 and 193 of the National Planning Policy Framework. We respectfully request that the Inspector allows this appeal.

APPENDICES

Appendix 1 Starkie's Farmhouse listed building description

Appendix 2 Photographs and key

Appendix 1.

SD 73 SE 3/63

SIMONSTONE SIMONSTONE LANE Starkie Farmhouse

GII Farmhouse, probably C17, altered, now house. Coursed sandstone rubble with quoins, (gable to road rendered), tiled roof with gable chimneys. Two bays and two storeys, with small single-storey extension at right end; in centre a modern lean-to porch, to the right of this a six-light transomed window with ovolo and fillet moulded mullions and transom, a straight drip mould over it, and left of the porch a two-light window with a similar mullion and a three-light window with cavetto mullions; first floor has two vertical rectangular windows with plain surrounds. Set-back single storey extension at right end has stone slate roof, and may have been porch to a gable-end entry. Rear is of less interest; interior not inspected.

Listing NGR: SD7745434286