

Graeme Thorpe

From: Nash2, Chris [Chris.Nash2@pins.gsi.gov.uk]
Sent: 26 July 2013 15:20
To: Graeme Thorpe
Subject: RE: Planning Inspectorate - APP/T2350/A/13/2193882 - Carr Hall Home & Garden Centre, Whalley Road
Graeme

Noted and added to file. On another note I am looking through the file and I can't see we have received the LPA hearing event notification. This should be sent to us at your earliest convenience and no later than 2 weeks before the actual event.

Thanks in advance

Regards

Chris Nash

Chris Nash
Case Officer
The Planning Inspectorate
Room 3/06
Temple Quay House
Tel: 0303 444 5426
email:chris.nash2@pins.gsi.gov.uk
team:teamp7@pins.gsi.gov.uk

From: Graeme Thorpe [mailto:Graeme.Thorpe@ribblevalley.gcsx.gov.uk]
Sent: 25 July 2013 12:53
To: Nash2, Chris; Team P7
Cc: Nicola Pugh
Subject: RE: Planning Inspectorate - APP/T2350/A/13/2193882 - Carr Hall Home & Garden Centre, Whalley Road

Dear Sir,

In response to the e-mail from the Inspectorate dated 11th of July 2013, sent in relation to the SoS for Communities and Local Government and the issued Written Ministerial Statement concerning Local Planning and Onshore Wind, Ribble Valley Borough Council wish to offer the following view.

Due to the high level of objections from the local community to the proposed development, the Council consider that this Statement adds further weight to the reasons for refusal. As noted in the Ministerial Statement, the coalition agreement pledged to decentralise power to local people and give local people far more ability to shape the places in which they live. This was due to their belief that planning works best when communities themselves have the opportunity to influence the decisions that affect their lives. The NPPF highlights the importance of early and meaningful engagement with local communities, noting the benefits of good quality pre-application discussion for onshore wind development and the improved outcomes it can have for local communities. Whilst secondary legislation to make pre-application consultation with local communities compulsory for the more significant onshore wind applications has not yet been agreed, the Council do not consider that appropriate, early community engagement took place in the case of this proposal. Pre-application advice was never sought for this scheme, and as the following links to local newspaper stories indicate, there was no community involvement at an early stage.

http://www.lancashiretelegraph.co.uk/news/9820686.Ribble_Valley_residents_anger_at_garden_centre_wind_turbines_bid/

http://www.lancashiretelegraph.co.uk/news/9843132.Packed_meeting_to_discuss_Wilpshire_wind_turbine_plan/

<http://www.blackburnlife.com/2012/07/campaigners-ribble-valley-turbine-alley/>

The Statement also highlights the need to ensure that protecting the local environment is properly considered alongside the broader issues of protecting the global environment. The NPPF includes strong protections for the natural and historic environment, however as the Statement suggests, many local communities, this one in particular, have genuine concerns that when it comes to wind energy development, insufficient weight is being given to environmental considerations like landscape, heritage and local amenity. Ribble Valley Borough Council do support the facilitation of sustainable development in suitable locations, however we also believe that the requirement to meet our energy goals should not be used to justify the wrong development in the wrong location, as is the case here.

In order to help ensure planning decisions reflect the balance in the framework, the SoS advised that they will seek to issue

02/08/2013

new planning practice guidance to assist local councils and planning inspectors in their consideration of local plans and individual planning applications. Whilst this planning practice guidance has not yet been issued, the following points are considered important in this case,

- That the need for renewable energy does not automatically override environmental protections and the planning concerns of local communities,
- decisions should take into account the cumulative impact of wind turbines and properly reflect the increasing impact on (a) the landscape and (b) local amenity as the number of turbines in the area increases, and that
- local topography should be a factor in assessing whether wind turbines have a damaging impact on the landscape (i.e. recognise that the impact on predominantly flat landscapes can be as great or greater than as on hilly or mountainous ones).

Given the reasons for refusal of this turbine, the Council consider that significant weight should be given to the content of this statement on the basis of the planning concerns raised by the local community, the significant landscape visual impact the proposal would have on the immediate and wider area and the proposals likely impact upon the amenity of the locality.

I hope this outlines the Council's position on this matter.

Kind regards,

Graeme Thorpe BA (Hons) Dip TP MRTPI |
Senior Planning Officer |
Ribble Valley Borough Council, Council Offices, Church Walk, Clitheroe, Lancashire BB7 2RA
T: 01200 414520 |
F: 01200 414487 |
E: graeme.thorpe@ribblevalley.gov.uk |
W: www.ribblevalley.gov.uk |

From: Nash2, Chris [mailto:Chris.Nash2@pins.gsi.gov.uk] **On Behalf Of** Team P7
Sent: 11 July 2013 11:36
To: Nicola Pugh
Cc: Planningappeals
Subject: Planning Inspectorate - APP/T2350/A/13/2193882 - Carr Hall Home & Garden Centre, Whalley Road

I refer to the above appeal, the Hearing for which is due to be held on 20 August 2013.

The parties will be aware that on 6 June the Secretary of State for Communities and Local Government issued a Written Ministerial Statement concerning Local Planning and Onshore Wind. A hyperlink to the Statement is attached.

<https://www.gov.uk/government/speeches/local-planning-and-onshore-wind>

The Inspector invites the parties to consider whether this Statement makes any difference to the appeal statement of case they have already submitted. If so, they are invited to submit a further statement, *addressing this matter only*, within 14 days of the date of this letter. They should ensure that they cross-copy their statement, as the Planning Inspectorate will not be doing so.

Chris Nash

Chris Nash
Case Officer
The Planning Inspectorate
Room 3/06
Temple Quay House
Tel: 0303 444 5426
email: chris.nash2@pins.gsi.gov.uk
team: teamp7@pins.gsi.gov.uk

Correspondents should note that all communications to or from the Planning Inspectorate may be automatically logged, monitored and/or recorded for lawful purposes.

This email and any files transmitted with it are confidential and intended solely for the use of the individual or entity to whom they are addressed. If you have received this email in error please notify the system manager.

02/08/2013



APP/T2350/A/13/2193882

Carr Hall Home & Garden Centre, Whalley Road

Response to Ministerial Statement and Comments from Ribble Valley Borough Council

The Ministerial Statement proposes amendments to secondary legislation to make pre-application consultation with local communities compulsory for the more significant on-shore wind applications.

At present, pre-application consultation is compulsory for wind farm schemes above 50 megawatts (MW). The majority of wind farm applications below 50MW require a formal environmental impact assessment and this process inevitably requires engagement with statutory and community stakeholders.

With regard to the proposed scheme, due to its siting away from designated landscapes and environmentally sensitive areas the proposed development falls below the EIA threshold. The proposed turbines are also of small scale in terms of their form and height and their nominal power rating (50kW).

It is unlikely that the proposed scheme would fall within the Minister's definition of a "significant on-shore wind application" and so it is not immediately clear how the secondary legislation outlined in the Ministerial Statement would affect small scale turbine developments not requiring an EIA, such as the proposal.

It is considered however that the level of community consultation undertaken as part of the scheme was entirely proportionate to the small scale of the development and that the views of the local community were considered and listened to by DC21 Ltd.

Perception of turbine scale has been a particular issue with this scheme and the press coverage highlights this. Both Lancashire Telegraph articles provided by Mr Thorpe in his email of 25 July quote a local resident as saying that the turbines will be the height of 5 double decker buses. It was widely rumoured in the local community that a wind farm of 30no 1MW turbines was being developed at the site. Printed material distributed by those opposed to the project showed utility scale wind turbines superimposed behind the Carr Hall Home and Garden Centre site. A "No" campaign was established and their logo incorporates a turbine of utility scale appearance.

<http://www.blackburnlife.com/2012/08/the-ribble-valley-is-not-the-place-for-a-wind-farm/>

The language used in the written objections as well as the references made to the extent of noise and shadow flicker impacts, strongly suggest a perception that a utility scale wind farm is being proposed at the Carr Hall site. There has also been strong criticism of the proposal in the press from the Leader of Ribble Valley Council.

<http://www.lancashiretelegraph.co.uk/news/blackburndarwenhyndburnribble/9820686.pri nt/>

DC21 engaged with the local community in order to address concerns over the scale of the proposed turbines. Engagement and consultation activities included:

- The creation of a website <http://www.carrhallwindproject.co.uk/>
- The development of a public information resource at the Carr Hall Home and Garden Centre. This consisted of graphic displays in the entrance/foyer, clothes shop and farm shop sections of the Centre. It also included the distribution of printed flyers setting out details of the scheme and crucially size comparisons of the proposed turbines.
- Direct consultation with immediate neighbours of the site. This included a meeting in July 2012 with Veronica Hargreaves and also with Barry Boardman of Little Snodworth Farm
- In July 2012 we were invited to a public meeting. Unfortunately notice was short and when we suggested an alternative date we received no response and the meeting went ahead without us (see attached email)
- In July 2012 we suggested an impartially chaired meeting with local residents to no avail (see attached email)

The Council's email response points to the high level of objections received yet this is just one side of the coin, as can be seen in the poll conducted at the foot of the Lancashire Telegraph Article of 17 July.

http://www.lancashiretelegraph.co.uk/news/9820686.Ribble_Valley_residents_anger_a t_garden_centre_wind_turbines_bid/

The poll shows that far from massive opposition to wind turbines, views are relatively even split. Unfortunately those in support of wind energy have not expressed their views loudly enough in the case of this scheme.

YOUR VOTE

Should developers be allowed to build more wind turbines in our countryside?

Yes:



No:



Thanks for voting - this ballot is now closed

Returning to the Ministerial Statement and the planning “practice guidance” outlined therein. It is our view that this guidance reflects issues already addressed in national policy and national policy statements on energy and renewable energy. For example, the need for renewable energy does not automatically override environmental protections and the planning concerns of local communities. This has never been the case and the National Planning Policy Framework confirms the long standing practice of balancing renewable energy benefits with environmental impacts. Similarly national policy and policy statements already require developers to address impacts on heritage, landscape and cumulative impacts in planning applications. The proposed development is considered to be in line with national policy requirements in this regard.

In conclusion, this appeal is not being pursued in order to override the planning concerns of the local community. This appeal is being pursued because, as demonstrated in the planning application, the proposal can be accommodated without giving rise to significant adverse impacts on heritage, landscape and local amenity. We welcome the Ministerial Statement and its objectives. We feel that the scheme meets these objectives and that the level of community engagement and consultation undertaken was appropriate to the small scale of the project.

From: Veronica Hargreaves [<mailto:v.hargreaves@hotmail.co.uk>]
Sent: 20 July 2012 13:53
To: info@dc21group.com
Subject: RE: Planning Application 3/2012/0539P

Hello

Thanks so much for swift response....it's Fri 27th July ...ie. a week today.

Best regards

Veronica Hargreaves

Tel : 01254 240015 (eve)

From: info@dc21group.com
To: v.hargreaves@hotmail.co.uk
Subject: Planning Application 3/2012/0539P
Date: Fri, 20 Jul 2012 13:51:34 +0100

Please can you clarify the date of the meeting. Friday July 21st does not occur this year.

Regards
DC21

From: info@dc21group.com [<mailto:info@dc21group.com>]
Sent: 20 July 2012 13:35
To: info@dc21group.com
Subject: Your website contact form

Website Enquiry

First Name: Barry Boardman

Contact Number: 01254 248674

Email: v.hargreaves@hotmail.co.uk

Comments: Dear Sirs Re: Planning Application 3/2012/0539P at RVBC to install 3 x 46 m wind turbines at Carr Hall Garden Centre This is to invite a representative from DC21 to attend a Public Meeting at Langho Community Centre on Fri 21st July 6pm to 8pm to sit on panel to take questions form local community and officials reagarding the above application, whch as you can imagine has provoked universal condemnation in the Ribble Valley. As Chairman of the meeting I feel it's only fair to allow DC21 to address the community and we would like to ask you to prepare a summary financil statement outlining the costs / benefits to the Ribble Valley. Please email on conatct above or phone me asap to advise name /numbers of attendees. Kind regards Barry Boardman

Nicola Pugh

From: Matthew Tidmarsh <matthew.tidmarsh@dc21group.com>
Sent: 26 July 2012 10:42
To: lewis.barow@hotmail.co.uk
Subject: FW: Carr Hail wind trubines

Dear Lewis,

The turbine positions are as follows:

T1 – 53°47'28.85"N 2°27'22.33"W – 370044E, 432878N

T2 – 53°47'29.20"N 2°27'27.27"W -369953E, 432889N

T3 – 53°47'28.68"N 2°27'17.56"W – 370131E, 432872N

Regards
Matthew

Matthew Tidmarsh



Dene House, North Road,
Kirkburton, Huddersfield,
HD8 0RW
Tel: +44 1484 607808
Mob: +44 7775 001699

Website: www.dc21group.com

Email disclaimer

This email and any attachments are to be treated as confidential and may be legally privileged. The information may not be used or disclosed except for the purpose for which it has been sent. If you are not the intended recipient of this email please contact the sender immediately and destroy this email. Email is susceptible to data corruption, unauthorised amendment, viruses and unforeseen delays. The company does not accept liability for the consequences of any of these actions. Any views or opinions presented in this email are solely those of the author and do not necessarily represent those of the company. The company will not accept any liability in respect of any statements made in this email. No employee or agent is authorised to conclude any binding agreement on behalf of the company.

Registered Address: DC21 Ltd, Dene House, North Road, Kirkburton, W. Yorks, HD8 0RW
Registered Number: 6855349

From: lewis barlow [<mailto:lewis.barow@hotmail.co.uk>]
Sent: 25 July 2012 16:35

Nicola Pugh

Subject:

FW: 3/2012/0539 - FAO Lesley Lund

From: Matthew Tidmarsh [<mailto:matthew.tidmarsh@dc21group.com>]

Sent: 27 July 2012 11:14

To: wilpshireparishcouncil@mail.com

Cc: 'nicola donelan'

Subject: 3/2012/0539 - FAO Lesley Lund

Dear Lesley,

With regards to our application for three small wind turbines at Carr Hall Garden centre, please find attached an information panel with further details about the project.

After discussion with Andrew Donellan at Carr Hall Garden centre we suggest a public meeting should be held urgently with yourselves and residents to put forward the facts about this project and have a constructive debate. I understand ward councillor Stuart Hirst has agreed to chair such a meeting.

We believe this is needed following the statement by Michael Ranson (the Lancashire Telegraph, which is totally out of line with his own parties policy, and the LCC policy on wind turbines), and totally unfounded rumours that the project is for thirty 1MW turbines.

Best regards

Matthew

Matthew Tidmarsh



Dene House, North Road,
Kirkburton, Huddersfield,
HD8 0RW
Tel: +44 1484 607808
Mob: +44 7775 001699

Website: www.dc21group.com

Email disclaimer

This email and any attachments are to be treated as confidential and may be legally privileged. The information may not be used or disclosed except for the purpose for which it has been sent. If you are not the intended recipient of this email please contact the sender immediately and destroy this email. Email is susceptible to data corruption, unauthorised amendment, viruses and unforeseen delays. The company does not accept liability for the consequences of any of these actions. Any views or opinions presented in this email are solely those of the author and do not necessarily represent those of the company. The company will not accept any liability in respect of any statements made in this email. No employee or agent is authorised to conclude any binding agreement on behalf of the company.

To: kevin.dare@dc21group.com

Subject: Carr Hall wind trubines

hello Mathew

following are discussion and so we can work out where the turbines are to be placed you agreed to email me with the grid references for each individual turbine. It would be greatly appreciated if you could reply with this information.

many thanks

Lewis Barlow on behalf of Barry Boardman

Snodworth farm

Snodwoth road

Langho

email: lewis.barow@hotmail.co.uk