

David Laskey

From: Helen Booth on behalf of Planningappeals
Sent: 15 May 2013 14:36
To: David Laskey
Subject: FW: Planning Inspectorate: Ref 2190784: Laneside Farm, Pendleton, BB7 1PU



FW: Planning Inspectorate: Ref...atement and 3rd ..Inspectorate: Ref... Inspectorate: Ref...

-----Original Message-----

From: Team P7 [mailto:TeamP7@pins.gsi.gov.uk]
Sent: 14 May 2013 15:29
To: Planningappeals
Subject: Planning Inspectorate: Ref 2190784: Laneside Farm, Pendleton, BB7 1PU

<<211L(H&I) - Statement and 3rd party reps - to LPA (H&I) 14_05_2013.pdf>>
<<RE: Planning Inspectorate: Ref 2190784: Laneside Farm, Pendleton, BB7 1PU>> Ja <<RE: Planning Inspectorate: Ref 2190784: Laneside Farm, Pendleton, BB7 1PU>> ne

Appellant's hearing summary statement and third party correspondence attached.

In response to Graeme's email on 10 May, I have requested the agent's views on how he wants to proceed. In the meantime, this appeal will continue as a hearing.

Regards

Nick

Correspondents should note that all communications to or from the Planning Inspectorate may be automatically logged, monitored and/or recorded for lawful purposes.

This email and any files transmitted with it are confidential and intended solely for the use of the individual or entity to whom they are addressed. If you have received this email in error please notify the system manager.

This footnote also confirms that this email message has been swept by MIMESweeper for the presence of computer viruses.

www.clearswift.com

The original of this email was scanned for viruses by the Government Secure Intranet virus scanning service supplied by Vodafone in partnership with Symantec. (CCTM Certificate Number 2009/09/0052.) On leaving the GSi this email was certified virus free.

Communications via the GSi may be automatically logged, monitored and/or recorded for legal purposes.

David Laskey

From: Graeme Thorpe
Sent: 10 May 2013 15:55
To: Team P7
Subject: FW: Planning Inspectorate: Ref 2190784: Laneside Farm, Pendleton, BB7 1PU

Importance: High

Follow Up Flag: Follow up
Flag Status: Flagged

Dear Nick Patch,

Just to keep the Inspectorate in the loop on the above Appeal, I received a call from Lucy Hodgetts (DIO Safeguarding - MOD) on Weds this week who advised me that the MOD wished to withdraw their objection to the above proposal. I have yet to receive this in writing from them however the e-mail trail between myself and Lucy Hodgetts is below. I will send the document on once I receive it, however can you advise me how this Appeal will be dealt with if there is now no case put forward by the Council, due to the key objection being withdrawn?

Kind regards,

Graeme

Graeme Thorpe BA (Hons) Dip TP MRTPI |
Senior Planning Officer |
Ribble Valley Borough Council, Council Offices, Church Walk, Clitheroe, Lancashire BB7 2RA
T: 01200 414520 |
F: 01200 414487 |
E: <mailto:graeme.thorpe@ribblevalley.gov.uk> graeme.thorpe@ribblevalley.gov.uk |
W: <http://www.ribblevalley.gov.uk/> www.ribblevalley.gov.uk |

From: Graeme Thorpe
Sent: 10 May 2013 15:13
To: 'DIO Ops North-LMS7b (Hodgetts, Lucy C2)'
Cc: DIO Ops North-LMS7a (Egan, Desmond C1)
Subject: RE: Planning Inspectorate: Ref 2190784: Laneside Farm, Pendleton, BB7 1PU
Importance: High

Lucy,

Can you advise when the information will be sent through to me ? I need to be able to liaise with the Inspectorate before close of play today so I had hoped to receive it earlier.

Regards,

Graeme Thorpe BA (Hons) Dip TP MRTPI |
Senior Planning Officer |
Ribble Valley Borough Council, Council Offices, Church Walk, Clitheroe, Lancashire BB7 2RA
T: 01200 414520 |
F: 01200 414487 |
E: <mailto:graeme.thorpe@ribblevalley.gov.uk> graeme.thorpe@ribblevalley.gov.uk |
W: <http://www.ribblevalley.gov.uk/> www.ribblevalley.gov.uk |

From: DIO Ops North-LMS7b (Hodgetts, Lucy C2) [mailto:DIOOpsNorth-LMS7b@mod.uk]
Sent: 10 May 2013 12:46
To: Graeme Thorpe

Do you have anything for me from your colleagues?

I cannot stress how important it is that I receive something from them ASAP.

Regards,

Graeme Thorpe BA (Hons) Dip TP MRTPI |
Senior Planning Officer |
Ribble Valley Borough Council, Council Offices, Church Walk, Clitheroe, Lancashire BB7 2RA
T: 01200 414520 |
F: 01200 414487 |
E: <mailto:graeme.thorpe@ribblevalley.gov.uk> graeme.thorpe@ribblevalley.gov.uk |
W: <http://www.ribblevalley.gov.uk/> www.ribblevalley.gov.uk |

From: Graeme Thorpe
Sent: 09 May 2013 10:13
To: 'DIO Ops North-LMS7b (Hodgetts, Lucy C2)'
Subject: RE: Planning Inspectorate: Ref 2190784: Laneside Farm, Pendleton, BB7 1PU

Thanks Lucy.

Regarding Laneside Farm, Pendleton, if you could stress the importance to your colleagues that I need confirmation as to why they are withdrawing the objection by tomorrow morning at the latest I would be most grateful.

Regards,

Graeme Thorpe BA (Hons) Dip TP MRTPI |
Senior Planning Officer |
Ribble Valley Borough Council, Council Offices, Church Walk, Clitheroe, Lancashire BB7 2RA
T: 01200 414520 |
F: 01200 414487 |
E: <mailto:graeme.thorpe@ribblevalley.gov.uk> graeme.thorpe@ribblevalley.gov.uk |
W: <http://www.ribblevalley.gov.uk/> www.ribblevalley.gov.uk |

IMPORTANT: The contents of this email and any attachments are confidential. They are intended for the named recipient(s) only.
If you have received this email in error, please notify the system manager or the sender immediately and do not disclose the contents to anyone or make copies thereof.
*** eSafe scanned this email for viruses, vandals, and malicious content. ***

David Laskey

From: Paul Mason [paul.mason@wbwsurveyors.co.uk]
Sent: 08 May 2013 10:35
To: Team P7
Subject: RE: Planning Inspectorate: Ref 2190784: Laneside Farm, Pendleton, BB7 1PU

Follow Up Flag: Follow up
Flag Status: Flagged



Hearing
summary.pdf (12 KB)

Morning Nick,

We have no further information to add to what was previously submitted as part of the written appeal.

As our statement was essentially the technical radar report, there is already an executive summary within this report. I attach the summary of this executive summary as our summary of the planning appeal statement (if that makes sense).

I trust you will find this all in order but if you require any additional information then please do not hesitate to contact me.

Regards

Paul Mason

From: Team P7 [mailto:TeamP7@pins.gsi.gov.uk]
Sent: 25 April 2013 17:29
To: Paul Mason
Subject: Planning Inspectorate: Ref 2190784: Laneside Farm, Pendleton, BB7 1PU

<<H4A - Hearing Start Letter - to Appellant 25_04_2013.pdf>>

Paul, truncated hearing start date letter attached.

Regards

Nick

Nicholas Patch
Planning Inspectorate
Appeals Administration
3/06 Temple Quay House
2 The Square, Temple Quay
Bristol, BS1 6PN
Tel. 030 344 45479
Email: teamp7@pins.gsi.gov.uk

SUMMARY

Large turbines and multiples of them in wind farms may cause problems to ATC radars. However, there is no published evidence of single, small turbines generating any ill-effects - no adverse safety reports have been published by the CAA or anyone else.

1. Turbine Will Not Be Detected

The calculation is that the turbine will not be detected by the Warton radar at all and it cannot, therefore, produce "*unacceptable interference*". The radar will not be

desensitised, false targets will not be generated and real aircraft will always be seen.

2. Trials Evidence Inferred by MoD Is Not Relevant to Single, Small Turbines

The MoD objection infers the effects from Trials but those Trials were conducted solely against large turbines and wind farms of multiple turbines. The Trials do not show nor do they infer any effects from a single, small turbine.

3. No or Negligible Operational Impacts

In the extremely unlikely event that the turbine is detected it will pose no hazard to ATC operations at Warton and will have no safeguarding implications.

- A single turbine is not a wind farm - it cannot generate false targets.
- The radar is new with modern software – the turbine will not show.
- The radar is designed to avoid low levels and its performance at and close to the horizon is significantly and deliberately degraded to avoid low level clutter - the turbine will not show.
- The turbine will be 'in' uncontrolled airspace and if detected at all, it will be handled as a transitory 'target' similar to those handled routinely in day-to-day ATC operations.

David Laskey

From: DIO Ops North-LMS7a (Egan, Desmond C1) [DIOOpsNorth-LMS7a@defence.gsi.gov.uk]
Sent: 10 May 2013 16:41
To: Graeme Thorpe
Cc: Team P7
Subject: RE: Planning Inspectorate: Ref 2190784: Laneside Farm, Pendleton, BB7 1PU
Follow Up Flag: Follow up
Flag Status: Flagged

Graeme,

Please see attached letter by way of update re. the above appeal.
As requested, I have copied this email and letter to PINS.

Kind regards.

Desmond Egan | Senior Safeguarding Officer, Safeguarding |
| Defence Infrastructure Organisation |
Building 49 | Kingston Road | Sutton Coldfield | B75 7RL
Civ: 0121 311 3790 | Mil: 94421 3790 | Mob: 07884357083 | Fax: 0121 3112218
Email: dioopsnorth-lms7a@mod.uk
Website: www.mod.uk/dio/
MOD Safeguarding
<http://www.mod.uk/DefenceInternet/MicroSite/DIO/WhatWeDo/Operations/Mor>



Defence Infrastructure Organisation

From: Graeme Thorpe [mailto:Graeme.Thorpe@ribblevalley.gov.uk]
Sent: 10 May 2013 15:13
To: DIO Ops North-LMS7b (Hodgetts, Lucy C2)
Cc: DIO Ops North-LMS7a (Egan, Desmond C1)
Subject: RE: Planning Inspectorate: Ref 2190784: Laneside Farm, Pendleton, BB7 1PU
Importance: High

Lucy,

Can you advise when the information will be sent through to me ? I need to be able to liaise with the Inspectorate before close of play today so I had hoped to receive it earlier.

Regards,

Graeme Thorpe BA (Hons) Dip TP MRTPI |
Senior Planning Officer |
Ribble Valley Borough Council, Council Offices, Church Walk, Clitheroe, Lancashire BB7 2RA
T: 01200 414520 |
F: 01200 414487 |
E: graeme.thorpe@ribblevalley.gov.uk |
W: www.ribblevalley.gov.uk |

From: DIO Ops North-LMS7b (Hodgetts, Lucy C2) [mailto:DIOOpsNorth-LMS7b@mod.uk]
Sent: 10 May 2013 12:46
To: Graeme Thorpe
Cc: DIO Ops North-LMS7a (Egan, Desmond C1)
Subject: Planning Inspectorate: Ref 2190784: Laneside Farm, Pendleton, BB7 1PU

16/05/2013

Wilpshire, BB1 9LJ

Thanks Lucy.

Regarding Laneside Farm, Pendleton, if you could stress the importance to your colleagues that I need confirmation as to why they are withdrawing the objection by tomorrow morning at the latest I would be most grateful.

Regards,

Graeme Thorpe BA (Hons) Dip TP MRTPI |

Senior Planning Officer |

Ribble Valley Borough Council, Council Offices, Church Walk, Clitheroe, Lancashire BB7 2RA

T: 01200 414520 |

F: 01200 414487 |

E: graeme.thorpe@ribblevalley.gov.uk |

W: www.ribblevalley.gov.uk |

From: DIO Ops North-LMS7b (Hodgetts, Lucy C2) [mailto:DIOOpsNorth-LMS7b@mod.uk]

Sent: 09 May 2013 09:30

To: Graeme Thorpe

Subject: RE: Planning Inspectorate: Ref 2193882: Carr Hall Home & Garden Centre, Whalley Road, Wilpshire, BB1 9LJ

Graeme

As discussed, the MoD's preference is for the hearing to be held during the last 2 weeks of August due to the confirmed annual leave of one representative of BAE Systems (19th July-9 August inclusive) who will need to attend.

Kind regards

Lucy

Lucy Hodgetts

Senior Safeguarding Officer (Engagements)

DIO Safeguarding

Defence

Infrastructure

Organisation

Building 49, Kingston Road, Sutton Coldfield, West Midlands, B75 7RL

MOD telephone: 94421 2443 | **Telephone:** 0121 311 2443 | **Fax:** 0121 311 2218

Email: DIOOpsNorth-LMS7b@mod.uk | **Website:** www.mod.uk/DIO

MOD Safeguarding

<http://www.mod.uk/DefenceInternet/MicroSite/DIO/WhatWeDo/Operations/ModSafeguarding.htm>

From: Graeme Thorpe [mailto:Graeme.Thorpe@ribblevalley.gov.uk]

Sent: 08 May 2013 09:27

16/05/2013

Sent: 25 April 2013 18:20

To: Graeme Thorpe

Cc: Planningappeals

Subject: Planning Inspectorate: Ref 2193882: Carr Hall Home & Garden Centre, Whalley Road, Wiltshire, BB1 9LJ

<<H4B - Hearing Start Letter - to LPA 25_04_2013.pdf>>

Graeme, please find attached our start date letter for the above appeal, which we have decided will be dealt with at a hearing.

In considering prospective dates please ensure the availability of any expert witnesses, such as the Ministry of Defence, who you want to attend.

Please note our guidance about the revocation of Regional Strategies below:

All Regional Strategies (RS) have now had Strategic Environmental Assessments published into the potential impact of their revocation. Based on the findings of these Assessments the government will consider whether or not the RS should be revoked in line with its proposal to abolish Regional Strategies. Some have already been revoked in response and in her statement of 25 July 2012, Baroness Hanham stated that "the proposed revocation of the Regional Strategies may be regarded as a material consideration by decision makers when determining planning applications and appeals". In the circumstances, you should carefully consider the current status of the relevant RS in relation to this appeal if you are intending to refer to it in the evidence that you provide.

Regards

Nick

Nicholas Patch
Planning Inspectorate
Appeals Administration
3/06 Temple Quay House
2 The Square, Temple Quay
Bristol, BS1 6PN
Tel. 030 344 45479
Email: teamp7@pins.gsi.gov.uk

Advice about the appeals process is available at:

<http://www.planningportal.gov.uk/planning/appeals/planningappeals>

Correspondents should note that all communications to or from the Planning Inspectorate may be automatically logged, monitored and/or recorded for lawful purposes.

This email and any files transmitted with it are confidential and intended solely for the use of the individual or entity to whom they are addressed. If you have received this email in error please notify the system manager.

16/05/2013



Defence Infrastructure Organisation

Your Ref. 3/2012/0526

DIO Ref. DE/C/SUT/43/10/1/17237

Ministry of Defence
Safeguarding
Kingston Road
Sutton Coldfield
West Midlands B75 7RL
United Kingdom

Telephone [MOD]: +44 (0)121 311 2443

Facsimile [MOD]: +44 (0)121 311 2218

E-mail: dioopsnorth-lms7b@mod.uk

Graeme Thorpe
Ribble Valley Borough Council
Council Offices
Church Walk
Clitheroe
Lancashire
BB7 2RA

10 May 2013

Dear Graeme,

Site at Laneside Farm, Pendleton, Clitheroe, BB7 1PU.
Planning Appeal Reference: APP/T2350/A/13/2190784

The Ministry of Defence (MoD) has received notification from Ribble Valley Borough Council that the above appeal has been submitted.

The MoD submitted a response dated 1st October 2012 to Ribble Valley Borough Council raising an objection to the proposal.

The MoD has reviewed this response in light of the appeal and I can confirm that the MoD withdraws the current objection to the proposal – that is to say that the MOD does not object to the Site at Laneside Farm proposed wind turbine.

In October 2012 the MoD objected to the proposed 22m wind turbine at Laneside Farm. (Planning Ref. No. 3/2012/0526)

Predicted coverage plots indicated that the proposed turbine would be detected by the Warton radar. As the turbine is located in a position where Warton Air Traffic Control routinely vector aircraft for final approach to Warton, BAE Systems, as the aerodrome owner and operator, advised MoD to object to the proposed turbine.

Since the original application, as part of on-going work to improve BAE Systems' response to wind turbine applications, BAE Systems has been working with SELEX, the radar's manufacturer, and its own internal experts to better understand the effect of wind turbines on the SELEX ATCR44S Radar. BAE Systems' principle is to ensure the creation of the best possible criteria on which to base decisions on whether or not to object to planning applications. This work has resulted in further



The Planning Inspectorate

3/06 Kite Wing
Temple Quay House
2 The Square
Bristol, BS1 6PN

Direct Line: 0303 444 5479
Customer Services: 0303 444 5000
Fax No: 0117 372 8181
e-mail: teamp7@pins.gsi.gov.uk

Planning Appeals
Ribbles Valley Borough Council
Development Department
Council Offices
Church Walk
Clitheroe
Lancashire
BB7 2RA

Your Ref: 3/2012/0526
Our Ref: APP/T2350/A/13/2190784
Date: 14 May 2013

— Dear Sir/Madam —

Town and Country Planning Act 1990
Appeal by Mr Mark Gornall
Site at Laneside Farm, Pendleton, Clitheroe, BB7 1PU

I enclose for your information a copy of the appellant's statement summary and third party correspondence on the above appeal. Normally, no further comments, from any party, will now be considered.

Yours sincerely

Nicholas Patch

211L(H&I)

*You can use the Internet to submit documents, to see information and to check the progress of this case through the Planning Portal. The address of our search page is - <http://www.pcs.planningportal.gov.uk/pcsportal/casesearch.asp>
You can access this case by putting the above reference number into the 'Case Ref' field of the 'Search' page and clicking on the search button*

